Gayle Munro

TRANSNATIONALISM

A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Review

The 'transnational turn' in migration studies, beginning in the early 1990s, has been the subject of vigorous debate by migration scholars, with 'transnationalism' (and its family members - transnational, transmigrant, transnationality) becoming contested terms as theorists discuss and develop different strands of the literature. The transnational paradigm has been enthusiastically accepted by those, from various disciplines, searching for a conceptual framework within which to situate empirical findings illustrating multiple and intense cross-border economic connections between migrants and their countries of origin (partly in response to dissatisfaction with older, already established models of migration scholarship). A number of thematic fields have been developed within the literature including transnational economic ties (Portes 1996; Guarnizo 2003; Sana 2005; Djelić & Quack 2010), political (Ostergaard-Nielsen 2002; Bauböck 2003; Guarnizo, Portes & Haller 2003; Bordes-Benayoun 2010; Lafleur 2013; Nye & Keohane 1972), cultural (Appadurai 1996; Hannerz 1996; Kennedy & Roudometof 2002; Jackson, Crang & Dwyer 2004; Koundoura 2012) or social (Faist 2000; Pries 2001; Vertovec 2003; Levitt & Glick Schiller 2004; Dahinden 2005; Bradatan, Melton & Popan 2010). Within the more general field on transnationalism, more specialist and focused 'sub-fields' of study have also grown and developed, for example on gender, transnational families and parenting (Pessar &



Gayle Munro, 'Transnationalism. A review of the literature', in: *Studies on National Movements*, 3 (2015).

Mahler 2003; Salih 2003; Skrbiš 2008; Carling, Menjivar & Schmalzbauer 2012; Baldassar & Merla 2013; Oso & Ribas-Mateos 2013), 'community' transnational practices (Guarnizo & Smith 1998; Riccio 2001; Batahla & Carling 2008; Bruneau 2010; Halilovich 2011b) and 'sub-sets' of the main themes, for example citizenship within transnational political literature (Kivisto 2001). However, the concept has also been interrogated by those who call into question how the acts and behaviour of 'transnationals' differ from the practices of international migrants through the ages.

Development of the field

Introduced into academic literature in the context of international relations in the 1970s by the work of Joseph Nye and Robert Keohane (1972), the concept of transnationalism is widely accepted to have been brought into common academic usage in the 1990s by American sociologists Linda Basch, Nina Glick Schiller and Cristina Szanton Blanc (1994; and Glick Schiller, Basch & Szanton Blanc 1992, 1995) and later developed by Alejandro Portes and his colleagues (inter alia 1996, 1999, 2001). Peter Kivisto (2001) in his review of the different ways that transnationalism has been conceptualised by migration scholars identifies a third 'version' of transnationalism in the publications of political scientist Thomas Faist (see especially Baubock & Faist 2010 and Faist, Fauser & Reisenauer 2013) who Kivisto attributes as developing the 'most rigorously systematic articulation of the term' (Kivisto 2001, 551). Observers (Schunck 2014) have, however, highlighted earlier work that could be considered to document transnational migratory practices: Zlatko Skrbiš (2008, 232) reviews William Thomas and Florian Znaniecki's The Polish Peasant in Europe and America (1918) as 'the first systematic study of transnational family life ever conducted'.

In their *Nations unbound* Basch, Glick Schiller and Szanton Blanc (1994, 7) outlined a definition of transnationalism and those who participate in the process as 'transmigrants':

We define 'transnationalism' as the processes by which immigrants forge and sustain multi-stranded social relations that

link together their societies of origin and settlement. We call these processes transnationalism to emphasise that many immigrants today build social fields that cross geographic, cultural, and political borders. Immigrants who develop and maintain multiple relationships – familial, economic, social, organisational, religious and political – that span borders we call 'transmigrants'. An essential element of transnationalism is the multiplicity of involvements that transmigrants sustain in both home and host societies.

In reviewing earlier studies on transnationalism, some scholars have lamented the lack of a commonly-agreed theoretical framework in which to site empirical work; indeed the beginning of every discussion is typically dominated by highlighting the challenges of researching transnational practice in the absence of an agreed definition of scope (Al-Ali & Koser 2002). Portes, one of the most frequently cited scholars of transpationalism, writing in 1999, stated that the emergent transpational social field 'lacks both a well-defined theoretical framework and analytical rigour' (Portes, Guarnizo & Landolt 1999, 218). Thomas Faist, Margit Fauser and Eveline Reisenauer (2013, 9), writing fourteen years later, state 'transnational approaches certainly do not (yet) form a coherent theory or set of theories'. Rejecting the term 'transmigrant' as employed by Basch, Glick Schiller and Szanton Blanc as being extraneous to the 'earlier and more familiar' term of 'immigrant' (Portes, Guarnizo & Landolt 1999, 219), Portes and colleagues maintain that the transnational field is 'comprised of a growing number of persons who live dual lives: speaking two languages, having homes in two countries and making a living through continuous regular contact across national borders' (ibid, 217).

Interpretations

In their attempts to 'turn the concept of transnationalism into a clearly defined and measurable object of research' (ibid, 218), Portes and his colleagues have delineated relatively prescriptive conditions under which a migrant could be considered to be operating in a transnational sphere. In particular it is the sustained and regular contact across borders over time

which, Portes insists, is a prerequisite for any activity to be considered transnational in nature. Occasional or 'one-off' payments to friends or family in the country of origin or irregular visits would not be considered to be of a level deemed intense enough to warrant the transnational label being applied. This focus is clearly couched within empirical studies of the experiences of labour migrants, as has been pointed out by others (Al-Ali, Black & Koser 2001) and is not so easily translated into the lived experiences of those migrating with different motivations, especially forced migrants. Indeed, Portes himself acknowledges that in applying such restrictive criteria to the concept, 'very few' migrants could be considered to be engaging in what could be termed as 'transnationalism'. Others have however advocated for a less restrictive application of the concept (Jackson, Crang & Dwyer 2004; Al-Ali, Black & Koser 2001).

A broader definition of transnationalism is provided by Steven Vertovec (1999, 447) as referring to 'multiple ties or interactions linking people or institutions across the borders of nation-states'. Vertovec (1999) identified six interconnected themes in which the phenomenon of transnationalism is evidenced: as a social morphology, as a type of consciousness, as a mode of cultural reproduction, as an avenue of capital, as a site of political engagement, and as a reconstruction of 'place' or locality. Vertovec circumvents the debate around what is 'new' about transnationalism by stating: 'Transnationalism (as long-distance networks) certainly preceded "the nation" (Vertovec 1999, 447).

An essential element of the conceptualisation of the transnational paradigm is the argument that those who could be considered to be transnational actors are leading 'dual lives' and the ways in which transnational actors are 'both here and there' or 'neither here nor there' seems to be a fundamental difference in the ways that different scholars approach the process. Glick Schiller and her colleagues (Glick Schiller, Basch & Szanton Blanc 1995) firmly site their 'take' on the phenomenon of transnationalism – which they have largely been responsible for conceptualising – within the context of the rise of global capitalism, arguing that the combination of advancements of the technological age and more intense patterns of international migration are creating ways of situating the migration experience differently from those of earlier

migrants. This 'positive spin' in the literature on the transnational migration paradigm emphasises the agency of transnational migrants as actors exploiting the resources available to them to make informed choices about the ways in which they carry out their lives across the territories of two or more nation states. Such a focus, however, arguably risks restricting the transnational space to those labour or economic migrants who are seen to be making empowered decisions and capitalising on the opportunities afforded by globalisation. That kind of transnational lens implies a neglect of any transnational spaces occupied by those who may not have migrated voluntarily, may be subject to stringent immigration control and may have a less than positive (at least initially) transnational experience.

Challenges and other approaches

The main challenges of the transnationalism paradigm are set around arguments that the transnational lens poses nothing new (Foner 1997; Waldinger & Fitzgerald 2004); that it is conceptually woolly (Portes, Guarnizo & Landolt 1999); or, that it depends on methodological nationalism (refuted in Wimmer & Glick Schiller 2003; Gielis 2009). Even those who adopt it as a conceptual framework are sceptical of its applicability to those migrants who cannot be considered to have made their migratory choices purely for economic reasons. But that will usually depend on how the paradigm is interpreted and applied.

Ewa Morawska (2001), one of the 'transnationalism-as-a-new-paradigm-skeptics', maintains that earlier practices of diaspora differed not at all from today's transnationals: 'Lifeworlds and diaspora politics of turn-of-the-century immigrants share many of the supposedly novel features of present-day transnationalism' (2001, 178). Roger Waldinger and David Fitzgerald (2004) in their questioning of transnationalism argue that the nation state and political control and constraint in the forming of communities means that what migration scholars describe as transnationalism is 'usually its opposite' (Waldinger & Fitzgerald 2004, 1178). Countered by Glick Schiller and Peggy Levitt (2006), for Waldinger and Fitzgerald transnationalism is dependent on freedom of movement.

They maintain that the conditions under which transnational ties are able to flourish and develop are not usually permitted under the control of the sovereign nation state which sees as its ultimate goal the preservation of the identity and culture of the majority. Waldinger and Fitzgerald, then, seem to imply that any transnationalism which does not adhere to the somewhat restrictive criteria as stipulated by Portes and his colleagues (that is to say, any transnational ties which could be considered to be transnational being and belonging over transnational acting) is a rather watered down 'continuum' version of the 'truer' transnationalism. Waldinger and Fitzgerald refer to non-continuous cross-border activity as 'something more erratic and less intense'. This also has resonances with the ways in which others have sought to differentiate between the varying intensities of transnational affiliations as expressed by those who migrate. Luis Eduardo Guarnizo (2000) for instance, detailed in Levitt (2001), refers to 'expanded' transnationalism in contrasting occasional sporadic migrant responses to political crises or national disasters in the homeland with the 'core transnationalism' of habitual, regular, patterned and predictable activity. Similarly, José Itzigsohn and Silvia Giorguli Saucedo (2002) make reference to 'narrow' and 'broad' transnationalism in making the distinction between continuous and occasional transnational practices. Faist, Fauser and Reisenauer (2013) however reject what they see as a binary distinction between the different intensities of behaviour and instead argue for transnationality being viewed on a continuum of low to high.

Transnationalism, diaspora and nationalism

Given the 'national' element of transnationalism, it is surprising how little of the literature draws upon the main theories of nationalism. These debates are not foregrounded to the same extent as they are in the field of diaspora studies which pays considerably more attention to the historic movement of peoples, the factors which contributed to the displacement of entire population groups (*inter alia* Brah 1996; Cohen 1997; Van Hear 1998) and the relationship between diaspora and *ethnie* (Smith 2010). One way however in which the transnationalism literature does dovetail

with some of the debates on nationalism is in discussing the role of the nation state and assumptions about its role as a primary unit of analysis. One of the reasons why some of the debates present in the nationalism literature have not cross-fertilised into the transnationalism scholarship may have been as a result of a deliberate choice on the part of those scholars who have been responsible for developing the transnational paradigm. Debates especially about whether methodological nationalism is inherent within the transnational lens began early on in the development of the literature (Waldinger & Fitzgerald 2004) and have continued more recently with the publication of Waldinger's *The cross-border connection* (2015) and especially within the symposium dedicated to its critique and subsequent 'defence' of the transnational optic (see Eckstein; Faist; Glick Schiller; Itzigsohn; Kivisto; Levitt; Waldinger in *Ethnic and racial studies* 38/13 2015).

Whether transnational activity is viewed as binary or on a continuum focuses on transnationalism as a practice or behaviour essentially quantifiable and measurable in nature. With such a focus on transnational activity, the voices of those who may not remit, vote, own property in the country of origin, have a bank account or even undertake regular visits to the 'homeland' but may still retain a deep and complex emotional relationship with the country of origin risk going unheard. Research on transnationalism of forced migrants can give a different slant on the theoretical field (Al-Ali 2002b; Jansen 2008; Van Hear 2014). Much of the debate around the 'innovation' of the transnational paradigm seems to have been carried out extraneously to any empirical findings, despite the call by some transnational theorists to 'ground' research into the practices of migration - whether transnational or not. Katharyne Mitchell also warns against 'theorising transnationalism in the abstract' (Mitchell 1997, 111) arguing that 'by bringing in "real" bodies, the actual physical, geographical constraints encountered by refugees as they seek to move across space challenges aspatial and abstracted concepts and "serves as a materialist connective to the unimpeded 'travelling cultures' and diasporic populations heralded by some theorists" (ibid). 'Bringing in real bodies' may mean that general conceptualisations are more difficult to land on, which may explain why some theorists prefer to work without them. However, reluctance (whether perceived or actual) to ground theories in the lived experience of migrants then risks conceptual murkiness and exposes the paradigm to prolonged and sometimes territorial debates.

Described by Faist (2010, 9) as 'awkward dance partners', the concepts of transnationalism and diaspora run parallel in some of the literature, merging and colliding especially within the context of discussions around community spaces and migrant identities (Bruneau 2010). Treated almost as synonyms by some migration scholars who may interpret each term more expansively, diaspora 'purists' are clear in their demarcation of the associations between each term. Khachig Tölölyan (2010, 37) for example, in reference to the Armenian diaspora or 'transnation' states: 'If nations have nationalism, then this transnation has "transnationalism", a term that in most venues is forbidden to me because, of course, transnationalism already has a more established meaning that developed in the 1970s, as in transnational corporation or transnational terrorism.' Such associations echo an earlier statement by Jana Evans Braziel and Anita Mannur (2003, diaspora may be regarded 8): 'While as concomitant transnationalism, or even in some case consequent of transnationalist forces, it may not be reduced to such macroeconomic and technological flows. It remains, above all, a human phenomenon - lived and experienced.' Such 'dehumanisation' of the transnationalism phenomenon is not present in the arguments of those who emphasise the bottom-up aspect of the transnational lens (Guarnizo & Smith 1998) nor in the focus of those who stress the relationship between transnationalism and communities (Riccio 2001; Sana 2005). Others however also refute the national in transnational, highlighting how the community frame of reference takes precedence over the nation state in the formation of translocal connections and identities.

Such ambivalence towards the concept of transnationalism has certainly been reflected in the literature for its apparent disconnect with the realities of the local (Harney & Baldassar 2007). The 'nation-state' focus of the transnational debates has been challenged within the context of the Bosnian diaspora, for example by Hariz Halilovich (2011b) who, in emphasising the importance of *zavičaj* to the structuring of identity for Bosnians, argues for a 'trans-local' as opposed to a 'trans-national'

conceptualisation. Zavičaj in this sense could be interpreted as loyalty and affiliation to the local 'neighbourhood' or more immediate local area rather than the 'homeland' as a nation state. Borrowing on the conceptualisations of Arjun Appadurai (1996) and Guarnizo and Michael Peter Smith (1998) and their 'trans-local' approach, Halilovich builds on the work of Nadje Al-Ali and Khalid Koser (2002) which discusses the difficulties of the 'nation' element of the 'transnational' label in applying to Bosnian (and other) refugees. Halilovich argues that the concept of transnationalism is 'less useful for exploring the relationship between movement, identity and memory in forcefully displaced communities from BiH' (Halilovich 2011b, 168). Those who have been forced from their homes as a result of the nationalist policies of ruling elites may demonstrate a noticeable rejection of affiliation with their sending 'nation state' and could instead draw upon more local or regional connections and lovalties in their collectivisation of memory and belonging, which in the Bosnian context could be interpreted as an instrument of defiance against the genocidal practice of 'ethnic cleansing' (Halilovich 2011a, 64 and 2013, 231) but could, of course, be equally applicable to the experience of forced migrants from other states.

The relationship between transnationalism/transnationality and assimilation (Guarnizo, Haller & Portes 2003; Sana 2005) and integration is also a focus in the literature (Mazzucato 2008; Gropas, Triandafyllidou, & Bartolini 2014; Schunck 2014). Drawing on Portes' theory of segmented assimilation and focusing on the infrequent and weak ties identified by others (Levitt), Paolo Boccagni (2012, 117) questions the applicability of the transnational lens and asks:

What is left of its theoretical import [...] after establishing that proper transnational activities, aside from remittances, are relatively infrequent; and that such practices are not incompatible with – and are even facilitated by – successful integration overseas?

Such a focus on purported 'proper' transnational activities represents a narrower approach to the transnationalism paradigm and suggests that the goal of every migrant is 'successful integration' however that may be defined. A focus on integration as an apparent 'end goal' and a preoccupation with 'proper' transnational activities could risk missing the nuances that are potentially captured with a less restrictive take on the concept.

Annotated bibliography

AL-ALI, N., 'Gender relations, transnational ties and rituals among Bosnian refugees', in: *Global networks*, 2/3 (2002) 249-262.

This article explores how Bosnian refugees within the diaspora use rituals to assert identities related to gender, religion and ethnicity – especially in relation to 'the other' (Serbs, Croats, non-Muslim Bosnians and non-migrant Bosnians).

AL-ALI, N., 'Trans- or a-national? Bosnian refugees in the UK and the Netherlands', in: N. Al-Ali & K. Koser, (eds.) *New Approaches to migration: transnational communities and the transformation of home* (London and New York: Routledge, 2002) 96-117.

Article which highlights the 'limbo' state of the transnational condition, specifically the impact that immigration status in the host country can have on the development of transnational ties. The author warns against exploring any transnational behaviour or identity solely through the lens of ethnicity to the exclusion of other demographic variables, such as gender, age, education, political affiliation, etc.

AL-ALI, N., BLACK, R. & KOSER, K., 'The limits to transnationalism: Bosnian and Eritrean refugees as emerging transnational communities', in: *Ethnic and racial studies*, 24/4 (2001) 578-600.

One of the first articles to move the transnational lens from labour migrants in the US to forced migrants within a European context. The authors question the labelling of 'community' to heterogeneous monoethnic groups and how transnationalism can be interpreted within the context of non-voluntary migration.

AL-ALI, N. & KOSER, K. (eds.), New approaches to migration: transnational communities and the transformation of home (London and New York, 2002).

Edited volume – part of the Routledge Research in Transnationalism series – which aims to explore what is 'new' (at the time of publication) about the transnational paradigm through chapters which include a number of contextual case studies as 'sending' and 'receiving' localities.

AMELINA, A., NERGIZ, D.D., FAIST, T. & GLICK SCHILLER, N. (eds.), Beyond methodological nationalism: research methodologies for cross-border studies (London and New York, 2012).

Book which consolidates previous work undertaken by the editors on the subject of transnationalism and methodological nationalism. Chapters include some case studies but mainly focus on unpicking the concepts and theories associated with some of the methodological challenges in conducting research on transnationalism.

APPADURAI, A., Modernity at large: cultural dimensions of globalization (Minneapolis, 1996).

Appadurai introduces the paradigm of trans-locality (as opposed to trans-nationalism) through a series of '-scapes' as a means of exploring global cultural spaces and flows. This concept of translocalism has been drawn upon by others who see it as a better fit on the community level than the nation state relationship suggested by the transnational lens.

BALDASSAR, L. & MERLA, L. (eds.), *Transnational families, migration and the circulation of care* (London and New York, 2013).

Edited volume which explores the reciprocity and sense of obligation inherent within the transnational family relationship. The volume includes sections on theories and case studies from several continents.

BASCH, L., GLICK SCHILLER, N. & SZANTON-BLANC, C., Nations unbound: transnational projects: postcolonial predicaments and deterritorialized nation-states (New York, 1994).

One of the first volumes which attempted to present a theory of transnationalism. Case studies included are mainly Latin American migrants to the US. The authors outline four premises which govern their understanding of transnationalism: 1) the links between transnationalism and global capitalism; 2) the processes by which daily life is carried out across different social fields; 3) the need to separate culture and identity from physical location and 4) transnationalism as a nation-building process linked to two or more nation states.

BATALHA, L. & CARLING, J. (eds.), Transnational archipelago, Perspectives on Cape Verdean migration and diaspora (Amsterdam, 2008).

Diverse edited volume which includes a series of 'diaspora community portraits' of Cape Verdeans living in different states. The second half of book focuses on a discussion of Cape Verdean 'transnationalisms' in different contexts, including language, music, politics, photography and family dynamics.

BAUBÖCK, R., 'Towards a political theory of migrant transnationalism', in: *International migration review*, 37/3 (2003) 700-723.

Article which explores the relationship between the sending state and its emigration populations through a transnational lens, presenting the case

for 'terminological distinctions' between transnational and other '-national' paradigms.

BAUBÖCK, R. & FAIST, T. (eds.), *Diaspora and transnationalism:* concepts, theories and methods (Amsterdam, 2010).

Edited volume which attempts to tackle the dovetailing of diaspora and transnationalism as twin theoretical concepts and to treat each as lenses through which social practices can be explored. Includes a diverse mix of case studies from across the globe. Includes a useful introduction on the two concepts of diaspora and transnationalism.

BAUMAN, Z., Globalisation: the human consequences (Cambridge, 1998).

Book which attempts to break down the concept of 'globalisation' into ways of assessing the impact on more localised pockets of power; addresses concepts of community agency and the role of the nation state in what the author presents as a very much 'top-down' take on globalisation.

BLACK, R. & KOSER, K. (eds.), The end of the refugee cycle? Refugee repatriation and reconstruction (Oxford, 1999).

Volume which looks at the role of returning refugees to reconstruction and development in a number of different post-conflict contexts. Chapters also explore the ways in which both sending and receiving states 'encourage' the return of migrants and discuss some of the ways in which the original 'home' can change in the post-conflict environment.

BLOCH, A., 'Zimbabweans in Britain: transnational activities and capabilities', in: *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, 34/2 (2008) 287-305.

Article which explores the relationship between transnational activities (political, economic, cultural and social), motivations for migrating and immigration status. Case study is of Zimbabweans to the UK but some comparisons are also made with Zimbabwean diasporic networks in other contexts.

BOCCAGNI, P., 'Rethinking transnational studies: transnational ties and the transnationalism of everyday life', in: *European journal of social theory*, 15/1 (2012) 117-132.

The author questions the utility of transnationalism as a theory, asking whether 'integration' can also encourage practices which can be considered transnational in nature, such as remittances. That argument does however presuppose an economic focus of transnational activity and also assumes that 'integration' is the goal of migrants in general. The article calls for a more nuanced understanding of a migrant's relationship with the homeland.

BORDES-BENAYOUN, C., 'Contemporary diasporas, nationalism and transnationalism politics', in: A. Gall, A.S. Leouissi & A.D. Smith, (eds.) *The call of the homeland: diaspora nationalisms, past and present* (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2010) 47-58.

Chapter in an edited volume which discusses the concept of diaspora as a symbol of non-national, deterritorialised global spaces.

BRADATAN, C., MELTON, R. & POPAN, A., 'Transnationality as a fluid social identity', in: *Social identities*, 16/2 (2010) 169-178.

Article which discusses the relationship between transnational and diaspora and asks the question whether such concepts could be

considered researcher labelling or whether migrants also self-define in such terms. Transnationalism, nationalism and diaspora are discussed within the context of several disciplines of study.

BRAH, A., Cartographies of diaspora: contesting identities (London and New York, 1996).

Often cited, especially within the context of gender discussions, this text addresses questions of diasporic identities and intersections related to place, ethnicity, race, class and gender.

BRAZIEL, J.E. & MANNUR, A. (eds.), *Theorizing diaspora: a reader* (Malden, MA, 2003).

Edited collection of essays arranged around themes of diaspora and modernity, ethnicity, identity, sexuality, gender and cultural production.

BRETTELL, C., 'Introduction: global spaces/local places: transnationalism, diaspora and the meaning of home', in: *Identities*, 13/3 (2006) 327-334.

Introduction to a special issue of Identities which explores linkages between global spaces, local spaces, belonging and meanings of home.

BRUNEAU, M., 'Diasporas, transnational spaces and communities', in: R. Bauböck & T. Faist, (eds.) *Diaspora and transnationalism: concepts, theories and methods* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010) 35-50.

The author uses the discipline of geography to discuss typologies of diaspora and transnationalism particularly in relation to mobility and integration.

CARLING, J., 'The human dynamics of migrant transnationalism', in: *Ethnic and racial studies*, 31/8 (2008) 1452-1477.

Article which discusses within the context of migrant and non-migrant relationships in Cape Verde and the Netherlands how such human relationships can shape and influence transnational ties and connections.

CARLING, J. & ERDAL, M.B., 'Return migration and transnationalism: how are the two connected?', in: *International migration*, 52/6 (2014) 2-12.

Introductory paper which sets the context for a special issue on the links between return migration and transnationalism. The article focuses mainly on the (often) blurred distinctions between (permanent) return and transnational journeys.

CARLING, J., MENJIVAR, C. & SCHMALZBAUER, L., 'Central themes in the study of transnational parenthood', in: *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, 38/2 (2012) 191-217.

Summary of literature on transnationalism mothering and fathering covering six themes: gender, care, legislation, class, communication and moralities. The article also discusses methodological issues.

COHEN, R., Global diasporas: an introduction (London, 1997).

Book which conceptualises different types of diasporas (classical, victim, imperial, trade, cultural) with empirical examples.

DAHINDEN, J., 'Contesting transnationalism? Lessons from the study of Albanian networks from former Yugoslavia', in: *Global networks*, 5/2 (2005) 191-208.

Case study of Albanian migrants to Switzerland which explores social networks and return migration. The article argues against making assumptions of transnational ties.

DE HAAS, H. & FOKKEMA, C.M., 'The effects of integration and transnational ties on international return migration intentions', in: *Demographic research*, 25/24 (2011) 755-782.

Case study of four African migrant groups in Spain and Italy which explores the relationship between 'sociocultural' and 'economic' integration and transnational ties.

DJELIĆ, M.L. & QUACK, S., Transnational communities: shaping global economic governance (Cambridge, 2010).

Presents a number of case studies to illustrate the authors' argument that transnational business practices and those who engage in them can influence global governance arrangements.

ECKSTEIN, S. et al, 'Symposium: Roger Waldinger's *The cross-border connection: immigrants, emigrants and their homelands*', in: *Ethnic and racial studies*, 38/3 (2015) 2267-2313.

A series of responses by a number of authors in the form of a symposium to the arguments posed within Waldinger's *The cross-border connection*. The collection includes a rejoinder from Waldinger himself.

FAIST, T., The volume and dynamics of international migration and transnational social spaces (Oxford, 2000).

The author of this text presents the argument that it is the development of transnational social spaces which encourage larger-scale outward migration from certain areas. The Turkish-German case study context also discusses the relationship between transnational ties and integration.

FAIST, T., 'Diaspora and transnationalism: what kind of dance partners?', in: R. Bauböck & T. Faist, (eds.) *Diaspora and transnationalism: concepts, theories and methods* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010) 9-34.

Introduction to an edited volume which discusses the intersections between diaspora and transnationalism as theoretical concepts.

FAIST, T., FAUSER, M. & REISENAUER, E., *Transnational migration* (Cambridge, 2013).

This book presents an overview of the main debates on transnationalism in different disciplines and aims to treat the transnational paradigm as a tool for researching migration in different contexts – social, economic, cultural and political. Chapters also discuss the relationship between transnationalism, integration and assimilation.

FONER, N., 'What's new about transnationalism? New York immigrants today and at the turn of the century', in: *Diaspora: a journal of transnational studies*, 6/3 (1997) 355-375.

Frequently cited article by those who contest that transnationalism is not a new paradigm, Foner draws on the historical experiences of migrants to New York in her argument that the phenomenon of transnationalism predates any labelling of the concept.

GIELIS, R., 'A global sense of migrant places: towards a place perspective in the study of migrant transnationalism', in: *Global networks*, 9/2 (2009) 271-287.

The author draws on Appadurai's work on translocalism by arguing for the application of the transnational paradigm through the lens of 'place' as well as 'networks'.

GLICK SCHILLER, N., BASCH, L. & SZANTON BLANC, C., 'From immigrant to transmigrant: theorizing transnational migration', in: *Anthropological quarterly*, 68/1 (1995) 48-63.

The authors develop their theory of transnationalism further in this article by conceptualising those who engage in transnational practices as 'transmigrants'. The case studies presented are ethnographic studies of Latin American migrants to the US.

GLICK SCHILLER, N., BASCH, L. & SZANTON BLANC, C. (eds.), Towards a transnational perspective on migration: race, culture, ethnicity and nationalism reconsidered (Baltimore, 1992).

Edited volume which was one of the first contexts to discuss the transnational paradigm as a theoretical concept. The contributors link the development of transnationalism to the rise in global capitalism and suggest that the transnational lives of migrants call into question key social science concepts such as race, ethnicity, class and affinity with the nation state.

GLICK SCHILLER, N. & LEVITT, P., Haven't we heard this somewhere before? A substantive view of transnational migration studies by way of a reply to Waldinger and Fitzgerald (Center for migration and development working paper, #06-01) (Princeton, 2006).

Paper which provides a counter argument to Waldinger & Fitzgerald's questioning of the theoretical value of the transnational paradigm. The

authors address in particular accusations that the concept of transnationalism is not new and that it relies on methodological nationalism.

GROPAS, R., TRIANDAFYLLIDOU, A. & BARTOLINI, L., Conceptualising the integration-transnationalism nexus (Florence, 2014).

EUI paper which discusses the relationship between transnationalism and integration and also reviews quantitative methods of measuring transnational behaviour and affiliations.

GUARNIZO, L.E., 'The economics of transnational living', in: *International migration review*, 27/3 (2003) 666-699.

Article which argues for a wider consideration of economic transnational living than is captured by a focus solely on the sending of remittances so that migrants' agency and their influence on global capitalist forces is acknowledged.

GUARNIZO, L.E., 'Notes on transnationalism' (Oxford, 2000).

Unpublished (but often cited) conference paper in which Guarnizo outlines what he defines as 'expanded' and 'core' transnationalisms to differentiate between the varying intensities of transnational affiliations.

GUARNIZO, L.E., PORTES, A. & HALLER, W., 'Assimilation and transnationalism: determinants of transnational political action among contemporary migrants', in: *American journal of sociology*, 108/6 (2003) 1211-1248.

Article which argues that political transnational action is undertaken by only a small minority of migrants and that such action tends to reinforce (rather than challenge) the status quo. The context under discussion is mainly migration to the US.

GUARNIZO, L.E. & SMITH, M.P., 'The locations of transnationalism', in: M.P. Smith & L.E. Guarnizo, (eds.) *Transnationalism from below* (Comparative urban and community research, 6) (New Brunswick, 1998) 3-34.

Book chapter which presents a view of transnationalism from a bottom-up community approach rather than a statist market-led lens.

HALILOVICH, H., 'Beyond the sadness: memories and homecomings among survivors of "ethnic cleansing" in a Bosnian village', in: *Memory studies*, 4/1 (2011) 42-52.

Article which presents the findings of ethnographic research into the experiences of return migration to a small Bosnian village where large numbers of the population had been massacred during the war in Bosnia & Herzegovina. The relationships between memory, memorial, place, ritual and reconciliation are explored within the context of the experience of those returnees mourning the dead.

HALILOVICH, H., '(Per)forming "trans-local" homes: Bosnian diaspora in Australia', in: M. Valenta & S. Ramet, (eds.) *The Bosnian diaspora: integration in transnational communities* (Surrey, 2011) 63-81.

Case study of Bosnian migrants to Australia which emphasises the *zavičaj* or local community aspect of their identity and affiliation as opposed to transnational connections at the state level.

HALILOVICH, H., Places of pain. Forced displacement, popular memory and trans-local identities in Bosnian war-torn communities (New York and Oxford, 2013).

Book which discusses the ways in which experiences of the war in Bosnia & Herzegovina have influenced the relationships developed within the diaspora and with the country of origin. The development of translocal ties and affiliations and the reproduction of the *zavičaj* within different

diasporic contexts is conceptualised as a defiance of the genocidal practices of 'ethnic cleansing'.

HANNERZ, U., Flows, boundaries and hybrids: keywords in transnational anthropology (Oxford, 1997).

Paper which explores what the author terms the three keywords in transnational anthropology. Boundaries are considered in the metaphorical sense of identity (particularly ethnic identity) and belonging. The paper concludes with a call for careful consideration of the lexicon of transnational study.

HANNERZ, U., Transnational connections: culture, people, places (London, 1996).

Hannerz presents the case for a global understanding of culture which crosses borders and goes beyond notions of the 'nation', the 'local' and 'community'.

HARNEY, D.M. & BALDASSAR, L., 'Tracking transnationalism: migrancy and its futures', in: *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, 33/2 (2007) 189-198.

Introduction to a special issue of JEMS which argues for a reconsideration of the concept of 'migrancy' and its connections with the transnational sphere to encompass 1) a greater emphasis on the agency of migrants 2) greater attention paid to movement across and within time and space and 3) a focus on unequal power discourses and the hegemony of the state.

ITZIGSOHN, J. & SAUCEDO, S.G., 'Immigrant incorporation and sociocultural transnationalism', in: *International migration review*, 36/3 (2002) 766-798.

A comparative analysis of transnational practices of Columbian, Dominican and Salvadoran migrants to the US which argues that the context of reception and mode of integration into the host society are key variables in determining transnational behaviours.

JACKSON, P., CRANG, P. & DWYER, C. (eds.), *Transnational spaces* (London, 2004).

Edited volume which explores spaces of transnationality through chapters mainly contributed by geographers and which include a heterogeneous set of case studies into gender dynamics, consumerism and fashion, remitting and the role of the state.

JANSEN, S., 'Misplaced masculinities: status loss and the location of gendered subjectivities amongst "non-transnational" Bosnian refugees', in: *Anthropological theory*, 8/2 (2008) 181-200.

Article which explores the forced migration experiences of Bosnian men and the effect that a loss of status has had on their identities in the host country.

KENNEDY, P. & ROUDOMETOF, V. (eds.), Communities across borders: new immigrants and transnational cultures (London and New York, 2002).

Chapters include a number of diverse case studies including discussions of transnational cultural engagement, religion, class, community and citizenship.

KHAGRAM, S. & LEVITT, P., The transnational studies reader: intersections and innovations (London and New York, 2005).

Edited volume with contributions from (mainly) sociologists and anthropologists which includes sections on historical perspectives and methodological innovations. Some chapters contributed by those authors who introduced the concept of transnationalism into the literature.

KIVISTO, P., 'Theorizing transnational immigration: a critical review of current efforts', in: *Ethnic and racial studies*, 24/4 (2001) 549-577.

Article which discusses some of the ways in which the transnational paradigm has been interpreted in the literature before making a case for conceptualising transnationalism as a subset of assimilation theory.

KNOTT, K. & McLoughlin, S. (eds.), *Diasporas: concepts, identities, intersections* (London, 2010).

Edited volume which includes a number of relatively short essays divided into three main parts: concepts and theories; intersections (chapters which discuss how diaspora links with other concepts) and empirical case studies.

KOKOT, W., TOLOYAN, K. & ALFONSO, C. (eds.), Diaspora, identity and religion: new directions in theory and research (London, 2004).

This volume explores issues of diaspora and identity with a focus on religion both in the ways it can help to form the organisational aspects of the diaspora and also as a tool for shaping identity.

KÖNGETER, S. & SMITH, W. (eds.), *Transnational agency and migration:* actors, movements and social support (London and New York, 2015).

Edited volume which includes chapters contributed from several disciplines – all with a focus on the agency of migrants as they negotiate social spaces within the constraints of the nation state. The book covers issues such as gender, citizenship, education, social work, diaspora remittances, religion and return migration.

KOUNDOURA, M., Transnational culture, transnational identity: the politics and ethics of global cultural exchange (New York, 2012).

The author explores the transnationalism of cultural exchange particularly through the medium of language and literature by weaving together voices from a number of different global cultures.

LAFLEUR, J.-M., Transnational politics and the state: the external voting rights of diasporas (London and New York, 2013).

Case studies of Italy, Mexico and Bolivia which examine the impact of diaspora activity on the political situation in the country of origin and the motivations for political engagement of the diaspora.

LEVITT, P., 'Transnational migration: taking stock and future directions', in: *Global networks*, 1/3 (2001) 195-216.

This article reviews the field on transnational practices to date, particularly in the field of transnationalism and assimilation, and suggests questions for future research. The discussion focuses on how (whether) migrants live their lives transnationally and on the intersection between migration and development.

LEVITT, P. & GLICK SCHILLER, N., 'Conceptualizing simultaneity: a transnational social field perspective on society', in: *International migration review*, 38/3 (2004) 1002-1039.

Article which suggests that by focusing a transnational lens on the study of migration, it is possible to highlight social processes that would otherwise have been missed. The relationship between transnationalism and assimilation is also discussed.

LEVITT, P. & JAWORSKY, B., 'Transnational migration studies: past developments & future trends', in: *Annual review of sociology*, 33 (2007) 129-156.

Article which summarises the field of transnationalism to date and offers reflections on future methodological paths in the field.

LEVITT, P. & NYBERG-SORENSEN, N., *The transnational turn in migration studies* (Global migration perspectives, 6) (Geneva, 2004).

Research paper which outlines concepts of transnationalism before discussing the migration-development nexus and making suggestions to policy makers for harnessing the power of transnational migrants.

LEY, D., 'Transnational spaces and everyday lives', in: *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 29/2 (2004) 151-164.

Employing two case studies of 'transnational businessmen' and 'professional cosmopolitans', the author argues for the adoption of a global city lens on the study of business migration.

MAZZUCATO, V., 'The double engagement: transnationalism and integration. Ghanaian migrants' lives between Ghana and the Netherlands', in: *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, 34/2 (2008) 199-216.

Case study of Ghanian migrants to The Netherlands which explores how migrants contribute to the economy in both the home and host states. The discussion focuses in particular on how the policies of the Dutch government can influence transnationally the circumstances for non-migrants in the sending state.

MITCHELL, K., 'Transnational discourse: bringing geography back in', in: *Antipode*, 29/2 (1997) 101-114.

Article which argues for a different approach to 'top-down' or 'bottom-up' studies of transnationalism by taking a less homogeneous approach to empirical case studies.

MORAWSKA, E., 'Immigrants, transnationalism, and ethnicization: a comparison of this great wave and the last', in: G. Gerstle & J.H. Mollenkopf, (eds.) *E pluribus unum? Contemporary and historical perspectives on immigrant political incorporation* (New York, 2001) 175-212.

Essay in an edited volume which challenges the suggestion that transnationalism is a 'new' phenomenon.

MORRELL, G., Globalisation, transnationalism and diaspora (London, 2008).

A review of policy and literature on diaspora, globalisation and transnationalism which provides a broad overview of the field.

NIESWAND, B., Theorizing transnational migration: the status paradox of migration (London and New York, 2012).

Case study of Ghanaian migrants which examines the integration of labour migrants within the host society and the positioning and status of those migrants within the country of origin.

NYE, J.S. JR. & KEOHANE, R.O. (eds.), *Transnational relations and world politics* (Cambridge, MA, 1972).

Often cited as one of the first texts to introduce the word 'transnational', this edited volume focuses on the relationships between states.

OSO, L. & RIBAS-MATEOS, N. (eds.), The international handbook on gender, migration and transnationalism (Cheltenham, 2013).

Edited volume which aims to explore the migration-development nexus through a series of case studies across the globe with a particular focus on gender. Aimed at a multi-disciplinary readership.

OSTERGAARD-NIELSEN, E., Transnational politics: the case of Turks and Kurds in Germany (London and New York, 2002).

Case study which examines the cross-border political affiliations and activities of Turks and Kurds in Germany. The book includes chapters on remittances and a summary of concepts and theories.

PESSAR, P.R. & MAHLER, S.J., 'Transnational migration: bringing gender in', in: *International migration review*, 37/3 (2003) 812-846.

The authors discuss how a gendered focus on migration can relate to a gendered perspective on other areas of study and highlight underresearched areas of study in the field of gender and migration.

PORTES, A., 'The debates and significance of immigrant transnationalism', in: *Global networks*, 1/3 (2001) 181-193.

Article which addresses some of the 'scepticism' around the paradigm of transnationalism, arguing that some of the issues raised in accepting the validity of the transnational concept has been because of methodological shortcomings in early literature in the field.

PORTES, A., 'Globalization from below: the rise of transnational communities', in: W.P. Smith & R.P. Korczenwicz, (eds.) *Latin America in the world economy* (Westport, CN, 1996) 151-168.

Chapter which couches a discussion of transnational communities within global capitalism. Portes presents an argument for encouraging government and policy makers to incorporate the transnational behaviour of non-elites into their practices and policies.

PORTES, A., 'Towards a new world - the origins and effects of transnational activities', in: *Ethnic and racial studies*, 22/2 (1999) 463-477.

Conclusion to a special issue of ERS on 'grass-roots' transnationalism which discusses some implications for policy makers in the sending states. The introduction to the same issue is also included in this bibliography.

PORTES, A., GUARNIZO, L.E. & LANDOLT, P., 'The study of transnationalism: pitfalls and promises of an emergent research field', in: *Ethnic and racial studies*, 22/2 (1999) 217-237.

Introduction to a special issue of ERS which presents a number of case studies on transnationalism. This introduction contextualises some of the theoretical debates on the transnational paradigm and answers some of the questions posed within the literature around establishing the concept. The conclusion to the same issue is also included in this bibliography.

PRIES, L., 'Configurations of geographic and societal spaces: a sociological proposal between "methodological nationalism" and "the spaces of flows", in: *Global networks*, 5/2 (2005) 167-190.

The author uses a case study of General Motors to present a typology of capital flows and human spatial mobility within spatial configurations including transnationalisation, internationalisation, globalisation and glocalisation.

PRIES, L. (ed.), New transnational social spaces: international migration and transnational companies in the early twenty-first century (London and New York, 2001).

Case studies include Turkish migrants in Germany and transnational lives in Sweden and Mexico. Many of the chapters focus on analysis of transnational corporations and capital flows.

RICCIO, B., 'From "ethnic group" to "transnational community"? Senegalese migrants' ambivalent experiences and multiple trajectories', in: *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, 27/4 (2001) 583-599.

Part of a special issue of *JEMS*, this article presents the heterogeneity in the transnational experiences of Senegalese migrants to Italy and warns against the dangers of essentialising the experience of migration by ethnicity.

SALIH, R., Gender in transnationalism: home, longing and belonging among Moroccan migrant women (London and New York, 2003).

Ethnographic study of Moroccan migrant women in Italy, with a focus on their articulations of 'home' and identity. Chapters include discussions on citizenship, religion and rituals.

SANA, M., 'Buying membership in the transnational community: migrant remittances, social status and assimilation', in: *Population research and policy review*, 24/3 (2005) 231-261.

Article using a case study of Mexican male migrants to the US to assess the impact of social status and integration on the sending of remittances. The author finds a positive relationship between loss of status in the country of reception and engagement in transnational economic practices.

Schunck, R., Transnational activities and immigrant integration in Germany: concurrent or competitive processes? (International perspectives on migration, 8) (Cham, 2014).

Text which explores transnational activities and identities of first- and second-generation migrants to Germany with a particular focus on the relationship between transnational affiliations and assimilation.

SKRBIŠ, Z., Long-distance nationalism: diasporas, homelands and identities (Hants, 1999).

Written before the field of transnationalism had matured, this book uses the concept of long-distance nationalism to examine the activities and affiliations of Croatian and Slovenian migrants to Australia through a historical lens. The author explores the ethnonational dynamic within different generations of the diaspora and the relationship with the country of origin.

SKRBIŠ, Z., 'Transnational families: theorising migration, emotions, and belonging', in: *Journal of intercultural studies*, 29/3 (2008) 231-246.

Article which highlights migration, emotions and belonging as the key aspects in the experience of transnational families. The dynamic of the migrating family is presented within the more stable contexts of state

control and the strength of ties with other family members either in the country of origin or within the wider diaspora.

SMITH, A.D., 'Diasporas and homelands in history: the case of the classic diasporas', in: A. Gal, A.S. Leouissi & A.D. Smith (eds.), *The call of the homeland: diaspora nationalisms, past and present* (Leiden, 2010), 3-26.

Chapter which provides an overview of the relationship between diaspora, ethnicity and nationalism through the ages.

SMITH, M.P. & GUARNIZO, L.E. (eds.), *Transnationalism from below* (Comparative urban and community research, 6) (New Brunswick, 1998).

Contributors to this edited volume explore theories of transnationalism and especially the intersection between transnational ties and the sovereignty of the state. The limits in the theoretical field are also discussed.

THOMAS, W.I. & ZNANIECKI, F., The Polish peasant in Europe and America (Urbana, 1996).

Student, annotated, abridged and edited edition of a classic text on migration and the relationship between a people and their country of origin.

TÖLÖLYAN, K., 'Beyond the homeland: from exilic nationalism to diasporic transnationalism', in: A. Gal, A.S. Leouissi & A.D. Smith, (eds.) *The Call of the homeland: diaspora nationalisms, past and present* (Leiden and Boston, 2010) 27-45.

The author explores the relationship between homeland and diaspora nationalisms and discusses some of the ways in which the diaspora discourse has transformed over time.

VALENTA, M. & RAMET, S. (eds.), The Bosnian diaspora: integration in transnational communities (Surrey, 2011).

Edited volume which presents case studies of Bosnian diasporas across the globe, looking in particular at the ways in which the diaspora dynamic plays out in each country of settlement and the contributions which members of the diaspora make towards localities and development in the country of origin.

VAN HEAR, N., New diasporas: the mass exodus, dispersal and regrouping of migrant communities (London and Seattle, 1998).

Text which presents data on some more 'newly-established' (as opposed to 'classical') diasporas, looking in particular at factors which contribute to or hinder the growth of transnational communities. The author also discusses the diaspora dynamic within forced and voluntary migrants.

VAN HEAR, N., 'Refugees, diaspora and transnationalism', in: E. Fiddian-Qasmiyeh e.a., (eds.) *The Oxford handbook of refugee and forced migration studies* (Oxford, 2014) 176-187.

Chapter in an edited volume which presents a brief overview of the field of diaspora and transnationalism in the context of forced migration; gives definitions of the concepts and intersections between the two.

VERTOVEC, S., 'Conceiving and researching transnationalism', in: *Ethnic and racial studies*, 22/2 (1999) 447-462.

Frequently cited article in which Vertovec outlines six identified 'clusters' of transnationalism.

VERTOVEC, S., 'Migrant transnationalism and modes of transformation', in: *International migration review*, 38/3 (2004) 970-1001.

Frequently cited article which covers a significant amount of ground around the main 'themes' of the debates on transnationalism, including: citizenship, remittances, belonging, family life and hometown associations.

VERTOVEC, S., 'Migration and other modes of transnationalism: towards conceptual cross-fertilization', in: *International migration review*, 37/3 (2003) 641-665.

Article which calls for the expansion of social network methods of migration research into the field of transnationalism.

VERTOVEC, S., Transnationalism (London, 2009).

Book which presents an overview of concepts of transnationalism before exploring social, cultural, economic, political and religious transnationalisms in more detail.

VERTOVEC, S. & COHEN, R. (eds.), *Migration, diaspora and transnationalism* (Cheltenham, 1999).

Edited volume presenting different case studies of diasporic relations with the homeland(s).

WALDINGER, R., The cross-border connection: immigrants, emigrants and their homelands (Cambridge, MA, 2015).

The author explores how migrant ties to the homeland change over time, in many cases despite efforts by the sending state to control their diasporas or 'emigrants'. In his argument Waldinger counters much of the premise of the literature on transnationalism, a counterargument which scholars of transnationalism have responded to in a symposium published within ERS.

WALDINGER, R. & FITZGERALD, D., 'Transnationalism in question', in: *American journal of sociology*, 109/5 (2004) 1177-1195.

Article which is critical of the literature using the transnational paradigm arguing that in their individuality cross-border ties do not reach the critical mass needed to be considered 'national' and emphasising the constrictions placed upon migrant communities by state control.

WILDING, R., 'Transnational ethnographies and anthropological imaginings of migrancy', in: *Journal of ethnic and migration studies*, 33/2 (2007) 331-348.

Chapter, in a special issue of *JEMS*, which discusses the validity of the anthropological, ethnographical approach to transnational study and some of the challenges posed to the researcher.

WILLS, K. & YEOH, B.S.A. (eds.), *State/nation/transnation: perspectives on transnationalism in the Asia Pacific* (London and New York, 2004).

Series of case studies examining transnational relations, identities and ties within and across different states in the Asia-Pacific region. The empirical chapters are set within a context of a discussion on theories of transnationalism.

WIMMER, A. & GLICK SCHILLER, N., 'Methodological nationalism, the social sciences and the study of migration: an essay in historical epistemology', in: *International migration review*, 37/3 (2003) 576-610.

Article which outlines some of the challenges posed to the social sciences by methodological nationalism and how this has presented itself in some studies of transnationalism.

YEOH, B. & RAMDAS, K., 'Gender, migration, mobility and transnationalism', in: Gender, place & culture: a journal of feminist geography, 21/10 (2014) 1197-1213.

Article which reviews the literature (particularly within this journal) published over the last ten years on the intersections between transnationalism, gender and mobility.

This review and annotated bibliography is part of The State of Nationalism (SoN), a comprehensive guide to the study of nationalism.

As such it is also published on the SoN website, where it will be regularly updated.

SoN is jointly supported by two institutes: NISE and the University of East London (UEL). Dr. Eric Taylor Woods and Dr. Robert Schertzer are responsible for overall management and co-editors-in-chief.

http://stateofnationalism.eu